The Property Tax-School Funding Connection: South Carolina

Lincoln Institute of Land Policy Webinar May 20, 2020

Laura Dawson Ullrich, PhD Regional Economist Research Department Federal Reserve Bank of Richmond



The views and opinions expressed herein are those of the author. They do not represent an official position of the Federal Reserve Bank of Richmond or the Federal Reserve System.



Richmond • Baltimore • Charlotte

Property Tax Reform in SC

- 1993: The case *Abbeville School District et al. v. South Carolina* is filed and the property tax revolt begins to gain steam as people anticipate a finding for the plaintiffs
- 1995: Homestead exemption eliminates school property taxes on the first \$100,000 of the market value of owner-occupied homes
- 2000: Motor vehicle assessment rates were decreased from 10.5 percent to 6 percent
- 2005: The anti-property tax movement gained steam as property values (especially on the coast) began to increase
- 2006: Act 388 is passed
- 2014: The South Carolina Supreme Court ruled in favor of the plaintiffs in *Abbeville School District et al. v. South Carolina* stating that SC had failed to provide a "minimally adequate" level of education
- 2017: The South Carolina Supreme Court suddenly vacated the 2014
 decision and ruled in favor of the state



Act 388 and Related Legislation

- Act 388 and related legislation contains several property tax related caps and exemptions
 - Tax Swap
 - The homestead exemption on owner-occupied homes was expanded to the full value of the home. In short, owner-occupied homes were no longer subject to the school portion of the property tax.
 - Rental homes, vacation homes, apartments were not included.
 Additionally, commercial properties did not receive the exemption.
 - In exchange for this reduction in property taxes, the state sales tax was increased from 5 to 6 percent.
 - Elimination of Sales Tax on Food
 - Act 388 eliminated the sales tax on unprepared food as of November 1, 2007
 - South Carolina has an exceptionally high number of sales tax exemptions. They exempt more potential sales taxes than they collect.
 - This includes a very low cap on motor vehicles sales tax of \$500 (was \$300 until 2017).



Act 388 and Related Legislation

- Act 388 and related legislation contains several property tax related caps and exemptions
 - Property Assessment Cap
 - A constitutional amendment was passed alongside Act 300 which limits property tax assessment growth rates to 15 percent over any 5 year period.
 - An exception is made for homes that are sold during that time period (point-ofsale assessment)
 - This can result in horizontally inequitable property tax liabilities.
 - Property Tax Rate Cap
 - Act 388 also included a cap on property tax rate growth equal to inflation plus population growth.
 - If school districts fail to raise rates in a given year they are not allowed to catchup in future years.
 - Strong population growth has made this a more minor issue.



Reality of the Tax Swap

• Lawmakers in 2006 claimed that there would be a \$84 million surplus in 2009 post-swap. Actual data showed a \$50 million deficit that worsened throughout the recession and into the early years of the recovery.



Richmond - Baltimore - Charlotte

Reality of the Tax Swap

- Eliminating the property tax for schools on owner-occupied homes leads to serious inequities across property types and locations
- Not surprisingly, districts with less commercial/rental property and fewer second homes are the ones hurt most

Allendale, SC; Allendale County

| | | Non-Owner Occupied Home |
|----------------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|
| | Owner-Occupied Home | or Commercial Property |
| Appraised Value of Property | \$250,000 | \$250,000 |
| Assessment Ratio | 4% | 6% |
| Assessed Value | \$10,000 | \$15,000 |
| Total Millage Rate | 0.696 | 0.696 |
| Property Tax Owed w/o Act 388 | \$6,960 | \$10,440 |
| Homestead Exemption from Act 388 | (\$2,880) | \$0 |
| TOTAL PROPERTY TAX PAID | \$4,080 | \$10,440 |

Hilton Head Island, SC; Beaufort County

| | | Non-Owner Occupied Home |
|----------------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|
| | Owner-Occupied Home | or Commercial Property |
| Appraised Value of Property | \$250,000 | \$250,000 |
| Assessment Ratio | 4% | 6% |
| Assessed Value | \$10,000 | \$15,000 |
| Total Millage Rate | 0.2461 | 0.2461 |
| Property Tax Owed w/o Act 388 | \$2,461 | \$3,692 |
| Homestead Exemption from Act 388 | (\$1,140) | \$0 |
| TOTAL PROPERTY TAX PAID | \$1,321 | \$3,692 |



Richmond - Baltimore - Charlotte

What has happened since?

- Many legislators readily admit that voting for Act 388 was a mistake.
 - "I don't know of any vote I regret more than that for Act 388, I recognize it's done far more damage than good."
 - "It hasn't worked."
 - "One of the things I've learned since then is that when you have a complicated bill that is very controversial and creates a lot of ripple effects, you can't tweak it the next year or the year after that to work out those kinks."
- But when presented with alternative proposals, all of which raise tax revenues through rate increases or tax base increases....
 - "It'll probably pass somewhere around Neveruary." Rep. Bakari Sellers



What has happened since?

- There have been several groups who have been tasked with looking at how to 'fix' the issue.
 - South Carolina Taxation Realignment Commission (2010)
 - Findings:
 - SC is a low tax state that is "plagued with structural deficiencies"
 - That tax bases needed to be expanded considerably
 - They were unable to consider Act 388 (per statute), but they did comment on the complexity of the SC property tax system
 - The Tax Foundation (2018)
 - Findings related to sales and property taxes:
 - The sales tax base must be broadened or it will continue to erode annually
 - Business inputs should be excluded from the sales tax base to avoid tax pyramiding
 - Property taxation should be more equally balanced among different classes of property (residential v. commercial)
 - Assessment limitations create serious inequities and can limit mobility or property improvements
 - The assessment ratios on different types of properties should be narrowed
 - Reliance on personal property taxes (e.g. business machinery, equipment, etc) should be reduced
 - Lincoln Institute of Land Policy (2020)
 - Recommendations to be made regarding the property tax given the limitations around Act 388 repeal



Is Change Afoot?

- In January 2019 the Governor, House Speaker and Senate President asked the Executive Director of the Office of Revenue and Fiscal Affairs to create a new education funding model.
 - The existing model has been used since 1977.
 - The new proposed model puts all state funds under one formula that distributes to school districts on an "equity basis" based on local property tax wealth.
 - Under the proposed plan, 55 school districts get more funding from the state and 26 get less.
- It doesn't appear that there is political will to pass it at this time.
 - "I don't expect anything to be passed out this leglisative season. It's too big of a decision affecting too many people." Sen. Ross Turner, R-Greenville
 - "It's not going anywhere fast. Once legislators figure this out, they should be sent to Washington to create peace in the Middle East." Sen Gerald Malloy, D-Hartsville



Questions? ... and thank you!

Dr. Laura Dawson Ullrich Regional Economist Laura.Ullrich@rich.frb.org



Richmond • Baltimore • Charlotte